APPLYING BILINGUAL TO ENHANCE GRAMMAR LEARNING FOR SPEAKING: SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW

FIBRIA CAHYANI, EDY SUSEONO*

Department of English Education, IKIP Widya Darma, Surabaya, Indonesia. Email: Edysuseno4@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

For concepts to be communicated, sentences must be constructed properly. To achieve these goals, it is essential to keep the ability to modify grammatical rules. A review of ten credible research revealed that many students in Asia and Europe have grammar difficulties. The age range of these students is 6–24. Information was found on the Google Scholar website. All articles were published between 2019 and 2022. The writings' themes center on improving grammar, speaking, and bilingual skills. The gathered data were analyzed using a systematic literature review method. Analyzing such data, it is found that all of the authors used bilingual instruction to teach the participants grammar in the English class. Implementing such a strategy leads to improvements in the pupils' speaking abilities. The development of other abilities such as reading, writing, and listening is impacted. This discovery will help teachers teach related subjects. It also motivates other researchers to come up with new findings.

Keywords: Bilingual, Grammar, Reading, Speaking, Writing.

INTRODUCTION

To communicate their intentions to others, humans utilize language. They trade information using it. To satisfy it, the vocabulary knowledge needs to be enhanced. People arrange the words to represent their thoughts. Arranging such words needs to be constructed to be understood. The process of construction builds sentences. The people must organize the sentences to accomplish the aim of the communication. To meet the understandable delivery, people need a pattern to make it. Without a pattern, word placement can be deceptive. If it is in the term arrangement, it leads to misunderstanding. Nevertheless, Grammar enables the understanding of word arrangement. It is the style that humans employed to convey ideas both orally and in writing (Marlini *et al.*, 2022).

People need to expand their vocabulary knowledge before exercising their grammar in sentences. The vocabulary used to express concepts is the most crucial component. People need to develop their knowledge of vocabulary. It stands in for the ideas. Through language, thoughts are rendered incomprehensible (Vysotki *et al.*, 2021). Learning vocabulary might be difficult at times. People must simultaneously learn the pronunciation and definition of words. Each word has a unique sound and definition. Various languages have different perspectives on this matter. The difficulty with vocabulary learning aggravates learning resistance. It is essential to come up with ideas to find a method to build vocabulary mastery (Fan, 2020).

It appears promising to use bilingualism for learning vocabulary. It will aid in the students' comprehension of the words' intended meaning. However, vocabulary also needs to be considered from a different angle. It involves pronunciation. The utterances are confused as a result of the pronunciation issue. Having a flaw in pronunciation hampers the language users' ability to conduct oral communication. Anticipating such an issue, the students can utilize their electronic dictionaries to master the pronunciation. Manipulating such a tool helps the students to comprehend the definition of each word properly. The students will be alerted to adapt proper words on the proper expression. Such a tool is provided by the application to achieve the vocabulary learning objective. Students can benefit from using their gadgets to meet such an aim (Suseno *et al.*, 2022).

The majority of the students struggled with sentence construction. It is brought on by the students' poor grammar and language skills. They find it difficult to practice speaking and writing English as a result of these phenomena. Grammar and vocabulary are two components that work together to create sentences. It means that pupils will be able to communicate their intentions in spoken and written forms with ease if they have a sufficient command of vocabulary and grammar. They will be able to communicate their intentions to others without being hindered (Suseno, 2021).

The grammar in each language is different. Implementing grammatical rules in delivering ideas often invites problems for language learners. Languages are crucial. The dialect is distinctive. When someone attempts to learn a different language, it is the root of the difficulty. In the mother tongue, sentence construction will differ from that in the other language. The grammatical usage used by someone in a certain language will not be adapted to another language. Language learners tend to become frustrated by these kinds of phenomena. It appears that a particular strategy must be maintained to go through it (Halim *et al.*, 2021).

Improving speaking abilities is essential. A strategy is required to achieve such an objective. It appears promising to teach speaking using cue cards. According to Putri and Sada (2021), employing such a medium improved the pupils' proficiency in speaking practice. The instructor talked about how the pattern concluded grammatical training. To increase vocabulary knowledge, some words are also discussed. Such a pattern and terminology were written by the students on a piece of paper. They glanced at it as they worked on their speaking. By using this technique, the students' speaking default was fixed.

In addition, the importance of the mother tongue should not be disregarded. The media helps people develop a clear understanding of vocabulary learning. In addition, it can be used by the pupils to build phrases. For the pupils to develop their vocabulary and sentence structure, the practice of translating from L1 to L2 and vice versa appears to be beneficial. In addition, it is obviously necessary to manipulate an electronic lexicon. The voice button allows children to practice their listening skills. The advantage of using an electronic

dictionary is this. The students can simultaneously learn the words' definitions and pronunciations (Suseno and Purwati, 2020).

The study's goal is to determine whether teaching grammar in a bilingual manner improves students' speaking abilities. Some research questions must be upheld to direct the pursuit of such a goal. Due to the systematic literature review method, some research questions will dig some information through the provided literature.

The inquiries are:
Where did the articles appear?
Which languages were employed to teach grammar?
Who is participating in the research?
Which countries contributed to the written articles?
What conclusions did each study arrive at?

A thorough evaluation of the literature will be done to determine the study's findings. It is a technique for gathering information by assembling articles on connected subjects.

METHODS

Collecting data are crucial for satisfying the study question's response. The source data itself will be examined. To answer research questions, a collection of related publications must be put together. They would act as the source of the data that would be analyzed. Setting up the rules is essential to getting the desired articles. To accomplish this, a few questions must be addressed before scanning the articles. Here are the questions so that the researchers can easily answer them.
1. Was Google Scholar used to copy the article?
2. Have the articles recently been published (in 2019)?
3. Does the article address speaking, grammar, and bilingualism?

These questions will aid in focusing the search. To define the search procedure, essential phrases must be established. Start by typing "bilingual, grammar, speaking" into the Google search bar and choosing 2019 for the year option. It is the key to discovering. There should be a cap on the amount of compiled articles. It is a method for making the analytical process simpler. As a result, only ten articles must be used to sort the chosen ones. To obtain the analysis, the intended articles for analysis will be assembled. The articles must be categorized depending on the criteria to simplify the analysis procedure. The first step is to list each study's results in a table according to the necessary criteria. Each research question includes the aspects. The responses to questions 1, 2, and 3 are supplied in a single table to simplify the analysis. To provide the study's findings, the submitted data will go through a qualitative analysis.

FINDINGS

The searcher was able to find the targeted articles after finding ten of them. They were located by modifying various question-method hints. The proof was stated in several categories to guarantee the accuracy of the materials. The supporting data for the responses are included in Table 1. There are four categories: Website, years, discussed talents, and language of delivery. The Google Scholar website was used to retrieve all of the papers. In the front row, it may be seen. It suggests the first question method's hint. The years they were released are mentioned in the second row. All of the articles were published between the years 2019 and 2022, as can be seen. The demands of the existing data were satisfied. The skills acquired throughout the article discussions are further explained in the row below. It was discovered that nine out of ten respondents had knowledge of the four language skills of hearing, reading, writing, and speaking. Only one of them concentrated on vocabulary, grammar, and pronunciation in English. Although it had a unique appearance, it covered the same subjects as the others. Through proper pronunciation, speaking and listening abilities are developed. Grammar and vocabulary development abilities were also improved. Building sentences requires learning them. The students' delivery abilities were enhanced as a result. Implementing such education affects pupils' capacity to advance their linguistic comprehension. Students' reading comprehension improves as they become more adept at deciphering messages through the study of grammar and vocabulary. The terminology used in the teaching and learning process in the articles is described in the last row. As can be seen, each essay discussed the use of bilingualism in both teaching and delivery. Each article uses a different combination of L1 and L2 language. It is evident that the mother tongue was modified to facilitate the use of L2. It is important to comprehend the subject at hand clearly.

The overall results presented in Table 1 answer the method-related queries. It demonstrates that the use of bilingualism in the educational process was covered in all of the publications. The only media to search the targeted papers is the google scholar website. The recently completed research is represented by the compiled materials. They were released between 2019 and 2022. Each article fosters the development of writing, reading, listening, and speaking abilities. However, speech development is the study's main focus.

Once the desired data have been obtained, it is necessary to confirm the classification of the data. Table 2 displays the responses to the research questions. Information on the article publishers is acquired as soon as research question 1 is raised. As can be seen, each paper was released by a different publisher. There are nine different publishers listed in the table. Listed are the Edunipa Journal, Asian EFL Journal Research Articles, Language Teaching and Educational Research, Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics, Journal of English Teaching (JET), Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences, Language Teaching Research, and Innovation in Language Learning and Teaching. The only publication to appear twice is Asian EFL Journal Research Articles. It was released in Australia and has a solid international reputation. The writers of the two articles that were published in this publication are from Pakistan and Saudi Arabia. Other periodicals produced in Indonesia include the Edunipa Journal, the Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics, and the JET. Such articles were written by Indonesian and Thai authors. The collated articles included publishers from the United Kingdom. They are Innovation in Language Learning and Teaching and Language Teaching Research. The articles in the journals were written by Spanish and Turkish authors. Three further works by writers of Iranian, Yemeni, and Spanish nationalities have appeared in the journals Language Related Research, Language Teaching and Educational Research, and

Table 1: The provided articles

Numbers	Website	Years	Skills discussed	The language of delivery
1	Google Scholar	2022	Pronunciation, grammar, vocabulary, English comprehension	Bilingual
2	Google Scholar	2022	Listening, reading, writing, and speaking	Bilingual
3	Google Scholar	2020	Listening, reading, writing, and speaking	Bilingual
4	Google Scholar	2022	Listening, reading, writing, and speaking	Bilingual
5	Google Scholar	2020	Listening, reading, writing, and speaking	Bilingual
6	Google Scholar	2020	Listening, reading, writing, and speaking	Bilingual
7	Google Scholar	2019	Listening, reading, writing, and speaking	Bilingual
8	Google Scholar	2020	Listening, reading, writing, and speaking	Bilingual
9	Google Scholar	2020	Listening, reading, writing, and speaking	Bilingual
10	Google Scholar	2021	Listening, reading, writing, and speaking	Bilingual

Table 2: The provided data

Number	Titles	Publishers	Nations	Languages	Methods	Participants	Results
1	Using bilingual teaching method to improve students' english-speaking ability at the eleventh grade of sint gabriel vocational high school maumere in the academic year of 2022/2023 (Yuvilda, 2022)	Edunipa Journal (Indonesia)	Indonesia	Indonesian - English	bilingual teaching	High school students	Speaking fluency
2	Grammar Instruction to Young Adolescents at Lower Proficiency Levels Through Metacognitive Intervention (Bozorgian *et al.*, 2022)	Language related research (Iran)	Iran	Parsian - English	Bilingual teaching	Junior and senior high school students	Bettering the grammatical performance
3	The Impact of Translanguaging on the EFL Competence Development of Arabic-Speaking Learners (Elashhab, 2020)	Asian EFL Journal Research Articles (Australia)	Saudi Arabia	Arabic - English	Bilingual teaching	College students	Bettering reading, listening, writing, and speaking skills
4	Mother Tongue Use in EFL Grammar Classroom: Attitudes and Impact (Moqbel, 2022)	Language Teaching and Educational Research (Turkey)	Yemen	Arabic - English	Bilingual teaching	College students	Bettering the grammatical performance
5	The tolerance of English instructors towards the Thai-accented English and grammatical errors (Osatananda and Salarat, 2020)	Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics (Indonesia)	Thailand	Thai - English	Bilingual teaching	College Students	Bettering competence in spoken and written performance
6	The Impact of Translanguaging on the EFL Competence Development of Arabic-Speaking Learners (Elashhab, 2020)	Asian EFL Journal Research Articles (Australia)	Pakistan	Urdu - English	Bilingual teaching	College Students	Bettering competence in spoken and written performance
7	Students' Perceptions of Teachers' Use of Bahasa Indonesia in the English Classroom (Sibarani, 2019) JET (Journal of English Teaching)	JET (Journal of English Teaching) (Indonesia)	Indonesia	Indonesian - English	Bilingual Teaching	College Students	Bettering competence in spoken and written performance
8	Seven Common Misconceptions in Bilingual Education in Primary Education in Spain (Madarova and Laborda, 2020)	Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences (Hungary)	Spain	Spanish - English	Bilingual Teaching	Primary Students	Bettering competence in spoken and written performance
9	Understanding the role of the first language (L1) in instructed second language acquisition (ISLA): Effects of using a principled approach to L1 in the beginner foreign language classroom (De la Fuente and Goldenberg, 2020)	Language teaching research (United Kingdom)	Spain	Spanish - English	Bilingual Teaching	College Students	Bettering competence in spoken and written performance
10	Translanguaging in the development of EFL learners' foreign language skills in Turkish context (Yuzlu and Dikilitas, 2021)	Innovation in Language Learning and Teaching (United Kingdom)	Turkey	Turkish - English	Grammar Translation Method	High School Students	Bettering competence in spoken and written performance

Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences. Hungary, Turkey, and Iran all publish them. It could be said that the essays were published with participation from 11 different countries. They are the location of the writers and publishers.

It is asked of each author of the paper in study question 2 that they instruct grammar through the language they use. It is acknowledged as bilingual instruction. It proves that the instructors presented the content in both their native tongue and English. Additionally demonstrated is the fact that only one article used the Grammar Translation Method during the teaching-learning process. The practice of bilingualism is everything. Indonesian, Persian, Arabic, Thai, Thai, Urdu, Spanish, and Turkish were among the first languages employed in the teaching and learning process. These languages made it easier to communicate and learn. It demonstrates the significance of the mother tongue in second language acquisition. It might improve your chances of learning to speak. It is beneficial to combine the usage of the mother language with appropriate educational techniques to improve speaking abilities. As can be seen in Table 2, the grammar-translation method and bilingual instruction are the methods employed to instruct the lesson. It highlights how crucial mother tongue practice is for improving second language learning. It benefits both teachers and students who use it.

Participants in research question 3 also got involved with the articles. There are four different types of participant groups, as shown in Table 2. The first group consists of kindergarteners. The involvement of

the primary school pupils was only mentioned in one article. Students in junior and senior high schools make up the second category. It can be found in one article as well. Both junior high school pupils and seniors participated in the activity. On the other hand, there were two pieces that requested participation from seniors in high school. In addition, six more papers invited college students to participate in the research. It demonstrates how the lesson's bilingualism implementation was tailored to the needs of students in elementary school, junior high, senior high school, and college. It firmly believes that using the mother tongue when teaching a second language can be adjusted for pupils at all academic levels. Although it is a flexible strategy for teaching language acquisition, the introduction of bilingualism in speaking classes will be coordinated with the demands. It is up to the educators to put it into practice correctly.

It was necessary to determine the participants' nationality for Research Question 4. It is essential to keep an eye on how the issue is evolving. Each paper's participants are from a different nation, as shown in Table 2. They are from countries in Europe and Asia. On two papers, the participants were from Spain. The other two are from Indonesia. The other articles simultaneously invited participants from Turkey, Iran, Saudi Arabia, Yemen, Thailand, and Pakistan. It suggests that the participants were from 8 distinct countries. It implies that implementing bilingualism to improve the acquisition of a second language is difficult. To use their mother tongue while learning another language, the participants stand in for their family members. Any tribe's acceptance of the use of such a method for learning a foreign language enhances their conviction that it is desirable. This type of discovery improves the way that students around the world learn foreign languages.

It is discovered that the authors completed the study after the teaching-learning process was complete and after making adjustments to multilingual instruction. To teach speaking in the second language, the teachers used their own native speech. It opens up the possibility of learning other skills by putting it into practice. To improve their speaking ability, people require other skills. It is the question that is posed by research question number 5. The information in Table 2 was used to arrive at the following conclusions: Speaking practice is successful, according to one article. It suggests that learning has attained its goal. Speaking proficiency through bilingualism is a key component of all teaching and learning processes. Success with grammar is shown in two additional articles. It appears that the emphasis has shifted to grammar as a component of speaking improvement. The emphasis shifted to sentence construction using bilingualism to improve speaking ability. It was also recognized that one article's reading, listening, writing, and speaking abilities were successful. It is a byproduct of improving other talents in addition to speaking. Four language abilities appear to have grown as a result of speaking learning. On the other hand, it was recognized that the other six articles had successful spoken and written abilities. The use of bilingualism in sentence construction had an impact on the growth of speaking and writing skills. Similar actions are required for each of these abilities to succeed. Grammar and vocabulary are both required for word arrangements to have meaning.

All of the results-despite the large range-improve speaking abilities. Success requires good writing, grammar, listening, and speaking practice. It suggests that all of the experiments were successful in facilitating language-based communication among the participants.

DISCUSSION

Preparation
Before conducting any research, a plan for collecting data is crucial. The data must be gathered from the linked area of study in light of the Systematic Literature review. The rules must be stated in order to satisfy such an objective. Getting the desired items is the rule. This will prevent the researcher from selecting the incorrect ones. The yes-or-no question is the method of guidance in this study. It serves to keep the researcher focused on the main objective of their article searches.

Three questions are posed. They speak to the articles' origins, including the website, the publication dates, and the subject matter covered. The scope constraint must be confirmed to define the intention. It is stated that Google Scholar is the targeted website. The years shown are as of 2019. Speaking, grammar, and multilingual content are required. Ten articles were located, solving the guidelines' final puzzle. As shown in Table 1, It is obvious that each article satisfies the requirements of the search guidance. The articles are the intended data source to be examined, thus that's what it signifies. It emphasizes that there should be no hesitancy in locating the necessary information in them.

It's vital to select the Google Scholar website. It is a globally recognized academic and scientific resource. Numerous scientific studies are posted there. Its material serves as a representation of the variety of academic studies that are available. People who enter the keyword(s) in the search field will be directed to sites with similar content. It enables users to select the appropriate options from the alternatives. When someone types "bilingual, grammar, and speaking" into the search field, they will find articles that contain those keywords. It aids them in making the sorting process easier. In addition, the menu of publishing years offered helps users find the articles in limited editions. The phrase "since 2019" is used. It indicates that the articles are current, having been published within the last 4 years. The publication is what displays the most recent problems. These results highlight the accuracy of the data.

DATA ANALYSIS

Publisher information
It is vital to know the publisher's details. It is a means of determining the caliber of the articles. As can be seen in Table 2, Asian EFL Journal Research published two publications. It is a respected journal on a global scale. The other three Indonesian publications, JET Journal, Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics, and Edunipa Journal, are also regarded as being of high quality. International journals make up the remainder. It emphasizes how reliable the data's sources are. Its contents might be examined to satiate the study's inquiry. In addition, it might deliver reliable results. Utilizing such publications reduces the researcher's hesitancy. He used it and felt safe. It aided him in sharpening his analysis. One could obtain complete results.

The delivery language
The delivery procedure acts as a roadmap for the parties to reach an agreement. Both the speakers and the listeners must be aware of the conversation's purpose. Throughout the classroom exercise, this viewpoint was presented. The students must understand what the teacher is saying. The lesson was not understood as a result of the ambiguity in the absorption. The teacher must communicate the material in an understandable manner. The authors of each paper used multilingual instruction during the teaching-learning process, as shown in Table 2. It aids the students' attempts to understand the essential ideas of the course. To improve understanding, teachers and students can converse with one another. By using this strategy, miscommunication between teachers and pupils is reduced. It led to the potential gain of (Shafi *et al.*, 2020.

Kinds of participants
It is crucial to understand the participants' types. It is a method for identifying the spreading range. It will influence the teachers to apply fair policies. As can be seen in Table 2, college students made up the bulk of the participants. Seven out of ten writers invited them to participate in the study. The other three used students from elementary, junior high, and senior high schools as participants in their studies. It indicates that adults who are learning to read and write encounter this problem. There are issues with learning English to improve communication. They required a quick and easy solution to improve their communication skills. It seems necessary to undertake the teaching-learning process in English classes using the students' native languages. They find it easier to understand the information, which improves their communication

abilities. Students in elementary, junior high, and senior high school all deal with this topic. It demonstrates that the implementation of bilingual education to improve English learning is a topic of interest for students from elementary through college.

Participants' nationality

The issue of learning grammar to enhance communication needs to be recognized. Recognizing the participants' nationality is necessary. It is the way to know the spread of the problems in learning grammar and the application of bilingual teaching. As shown in Table 2, the participants were derived from two continents Asia and Europe. The countries are Indonesia, Turkey, Iran, Saudi, Yemen, Thailand, and Pakistan. It indicates that the issue is spreading internationally. This kind of phenomenon neglects the notion that enhancing L2 learning using the mother tongue is forbidden. It is suggested that using bilingual language to enhance L2 learning is promising. The implementation of a mother tongue to deliver L2 learning eases the students to ease the process of learning. It is important to support the success of implementing L2 in communication.

RESULT OF STUDIES

It is important to know the outcomes of using bilingual instruction when delivering English lessons. It's important to understand how well bilingual grammar instruction works to improve speaking. The details are in Table 2. It is clear that all of the investigations have led to improvements in speaking. In two studies, it is not explicitly stated. The findings indicated that the students' grammar skills improved. The method used to construct sentences is grammar. People exploit their linguistic skills to succeed. Grammar and vocabulary work together to convey ideas. It thereby improves communication. It could be written or spoken. On the flip side, one article successfully led the development of the participle in speaking, while another piece successfully led the development of the four language skills. Six more studies showed that the students had succeeded in honing both their verbal and written communication skills. It signifies that the conclusion drawn from the total results is the same. It's all about improving speaking ability.

By looking through 10 reliable collected publications, it can be seen that using bilingual grammar instruction makes students more adept at communicating their thoughts. By using this strategy, other abilities like reading, listening, and writing also advanced. By modifying bilingual teaching, it may be possible to solve the students' L2 learning difficulty. It is advised that teachers use these discoveries to teach the associated disciplines. It is advantageous for other researchers to do comparable studies in order to obtain different outcomes.

CONCLUSION

Grammar in particular is difficult to learn when studying a second language. Various languages have different guidelines for how words should be placed together to form phrases and sentences. It presents difficulties to language learners of all ages. Students around the world experience it. They require a simple solution to such issues. Speaking ability improves when lessons are taught in English class using the student's mother tongue. The improvement of other linguistic abilities like reading, listening, and writing is also influenced by implementing such an approach.

AUTHOR(S) CONTRIBUTION

Fibria Cahyani: She is an English lecturer at IKIP Widya Darma Surabaya. He teaches writing, speaking, and reading. Her contribution is: Conceived and designed the analysis; collected the data; contributed data or analysis tools.

Edy Suseno: He is an English lecturer in IKIP Widya Darma Surabaya. He teaches writing, speaking, and reading. His contribution is: Performed the analysis and wrote the paper.

REFERENCES

Bozorgian, H., Fallahpour, S., & Muhammadpour, M. (2022). Grammar instruction to young adolescents at lower proficiency levels through metacognitive intervention. *Language Related Research*, *13*(3), 339-369.

De la Fuente, M. J., & Goldenberg, C. (2020). Understanding the role of the first language (L1) in instructed second language acquisition (ISLA): Effects of using a principled approach to L1 in the beginner foreign language classroom. *Language Teaching Research*, *26*, 943-962.

Elashhab, S. (2020). The impact of translanguaging on the EFL competence development of Arabic speaking learners. *Asian EFL Journal Research Articles*, *27*(3), 393-413.

Fan, N. (2020). Strategy use in second language vocabulary learning and its relationships with the breadth and depth of vocabulary knowledge: A structural equation modeling study. *Frontiers in Psychology*, *11*, 752.

Halim, T., Wahid, R., & Halim, S. (2021). Challenges of teaching and learning grammar in online classes at the tertiary level. *ELT Forum: Journal of English Language Teaching*, *10*(3), 212-221.

Madarova, S., & Laborda, J. G. (2020). Seven common misconceptions in bilingual education in primary education in Spain. *Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences*, *15*(2), 358-368.

Marlini, S., Yunita, W., & Syahrial, S. (2022). Grammar in spoken discourse: A need analysis of English education study program students. *Jurnal Iqra': Kajian Ilmu Pendidikan*, *7*(1), 164-177.

Moqbel, M. S. (2022). Mother tongue use in EFL grammar classroom: Attitudes and impact. *Language Teaching and Educational Research*, *5*(1), 36-58.

Osatananda, V., & Salarat, P. (2020). The tolerance of English instructors towards the Thai-accented English and grammatical errors. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, *9*(3), 685-694.

Putri, D. S., & Sada, C. (2021). Improving students' speaking skill in the aspect of grammar and vocabulary about describing animals by using cue cards media. *Journal of English Education Program*, *2*(2), 87-96.

Shafi, S., Kazmi, S. H., & Asif, R. (2020). Benefits of code-switching in language learning classroom at university of education Lahore. *International Research Journal of Management, IT and Social Sciences*, *7*(1), 227-234.

Sibarani, C. (2019). Students' perceptions of teachers' use of Bahasa Indonesia in the English classroom. *Journal of English Teaching*, *5*(3), 217.

Suseno, E. (2020). Learning speaking through communicative grammar on systemic functional linguistics (Sfl). *ELT Worldwide*, *7*(2), 136-50.

Suseno, E., & Purwati, O. (2020). Enhancing speaking proficiency by adapting grammar-translation method and electronic dictionary for young learners. *Indonesian Journal of English Teaching*, *9*(1), 44-66.

Suseno, E., Purnomo, H., & Nuryana, A. (2022). The implementation of grammar translation method to better speaking competence supported by developing reading and listening skills. *International Journal of Indonesian Education and Teaching*, *6*(1), 61-79.

Vysotki, V. M., Patalashko, E. V., Stepanenko, V. E., Makarova, T. V., & Balabanova, I. A. (2021). Language as a communication resource and its place in the representation of world practices: Philosophical and linguistic approach. *Linguistics and Culture Review*, *5*(S3), 574-584.

Yuvilda, M. (2022). Using bilingual teaching method to improve students' English-speaking ability at the eleventh grade of Sint Gabriel vocational high school Maumere in the academic year of 2022/2023. *Edunipa Journal*, *3*(3), 12-17.

Yuzlu, M. Y., & Dikilitas, K. (2021). Translanguaging in the development of EFL learners' foreign language skills in Turkish context. *Innovation in Language Learning and Teaching*, *16*(2), 1-15.